



This is a digital copy of a book that was preserved for generations on library shelves before it was carefully scanned by Google as part of a project to make the world's books discoverable online.

It has survived long enough for the copyright to expire and the book to enter the public domain. A public domain book is one that was never subject to copyright or whose legal copyright term has expired. Whether a book is in the public domain may vary country to country. Public domain books are our gateways to the past, representing a wealth of history, culture and knowledge that's often difficult to discover.

Marks, notations and other marginalia present in the original volume will appear in this file - a reminder of this book's long journey from the publisher to a library and finally to you.

Usage guidelines

Google is proud to partner with libraries to digitize public domain materials and make them widely accessible. Public domain books belong to the public and we are merely their custodians. Nevertheless, this work is expensive, so in order to keep providing this resource, we have taken steps to prevent abuse by commercial parties, including placing technical restrictions on automated querying.

We also ask that you:

- + *Make non-commercial use of the files* We designed Google Book Search for use by individuals, and we request that you use these files for personal, non-commercial purposes.
- + *Refrain from automated querying* Do not send automated queries of any sort to Google's system: If you are conducting research on machine translation, optical character recognition or other areas where access to a large amount of text is helpful, please contact us. We encourage the use of public domain materials for these purposes and may be able to help.
- + *Maintain attribution* The Google "watermark" you see on each file is essential for informing people about this project and helping them find additional materials through Google Book Search. Please do not remove it.
- + *Keep it legal* Whatever your use, remember that you are responsible for ensuring that what you are doing is legal. Do not assume that just because we believe a book is in the public domain for users in the United States, that the work is also in the public domain for users in other countries. Whether a book is still in copyright varies from country to country, and we can't offer guidance on whether any specific use of any specific book is allowed. Please do not assume that a book's appearance in Google Book Search means it can be used in any manner anywhere in the world. Copyright infringement liability can be quite severe.

About Google Book Search

Google's mission is to organize the world's information and to make it universally accessible and useful. Google Book Search helps readers discover the world's books while helping authors and publishers reach new audiences. You can search through the full text of this book on the web at <http://books.google.com/>

THIRTY-FOURTH
ANNUAL REPORT
OF THE
DANTE SOCIETY
(CAMBRIDGE, MASS.)

1915

ACCOMPANYING PAPERS

THE LYRICS OF FAZIO DEGLI UBERTI IN THEIR
RELATION TO DANTE

By Charles Edward Whitmore

THREE DANTE NOTES

By Ernest Hatch Wilkins

BOSTON
GINN AND COMPANY
(FOR THE DANTE SOCIETY)

1917

24

COPYRIGHT, 1917
BY THE DANTE SOCIETY

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

The Athenaeum Press
GINN AND COMPANY • PRO-
PRIETORS • BOSTON • U.S.A.

OFFICERS FOR 1914-1915

President

EDWARD STEVENS SHELDON

Vice President

CHARLES HALL GRANDGENT

Members of the Council

WILLIAM ROSCOE THAYER

JEREMIAH DENIS MATTHIAS FORD

MISS KATHARINE VAUGHAN SPENCER

Librarian

WILLIAM COOLIDGE LANE

Cambridge, Mass.

Secretary and Treasurer

FRED NORRIS ROBINSON

Cambridge, Mass.

6-30-11
to
+
win
000233

OFFICERS FOR 1915-1916

President

CHARLES HALL GRANDGENT

Vice President

WILLIAM ROSCOE THAYER

Members of the Council

JEREMIAH DENIS MATTHIAS FORD
MISS KATHARINE VAUGHAN SPENCER
CHANDLER RATHFON POST

Librarian

WILLIAM COOLIDGE LANE

Cambridge, Mass.

Secretary and Treasurer

FRED NORRIS ROBINSON

Cambridge, Mass.

LIST OF MEMBERS

HONORARY MEMBERS

	ELECTED
*ADOLFO BARTOLI	1889
*GIOSUÈ CARDUCCI	1889
ALESSANDRO D'ANCONA	1895
ISIDORO DEL LUNGO	1905
FRANCESCO D'OVIDIO	1903
EDWARD MOORE	1889
*THEODOR PAUR	1889
PIO RAJNA	1896
*JOHANN ANDREAS SCARTAZZINI	1889
PAGET TOYNBEE	1905
WILLIAM WARREN VERNON	1889
BERTHOLD WIESE	1903

MEMBERS

*PHILIP S. ABBOT	
CLARK HAMILTON ABBOTT	New York, N.Y.
EDWARD L. ADAMS	Ann Arbor, Mich.
*WILLIAM E. ALLEN	
MELVILLE B. ANDERSON	Palo Alto, Cal.
GEORGE A. ARMOUR	Princeton, N.J.
MRS. DANIEL M. BATES	Cambridge, Mass.
MRS. W. C. BATES	New York, N.Y.
*THOMAS D. BERGEN	
MARCO BESSO	Rome, Italy
MISS LOUISA BLAKE	Worcester, Mass.
MISS ALICE W. BOND	West Newton, Mass.
LAWRENCE BOND	Boston, Mass.

* Deceased.

R. BRINDISI	Boston, Mass.
*FRANCIS BULLARD	
*A. J. BUTLER	
*GEORGE R. CARPENTER	
MORRIS CARTER	Boston, Mass.
G. CAVICCHIA	Columbia, Mo.
JOHN J. CHAPMAN	New York, N.Y.
CHICAGO LITERARY CLUB	Chicago, Ill.
*GEORGE W. CHILDS	
ARCHIBALD CARY COOLIDGE	Cambridge, Mass.
*MRS. C. R. CORSON	
*GEORGE WILLIAM CURTIS	
*MRS. R. H. DANA	
MISS ROSE C. DEXTER	Boston, Mass.
C. A. DINSMORE	Waterbury, Conn.
R. E. N. DODGE	Madison, Wis.
*EDMUND DWIGHT	
*A. M. ELLIOTT	
F. ETTARI	New Rochelle, N.J.
MISS EDITH FAHNESTOCK	Poughkeepsie, N.Y.
J. C. FALES	Danville, Ky.
E. A. FAY	Washington, D.C.
MISS C. FEJÉRVÁRY	Hungary
GEORGE H. FISHER	Philadelphia, Pa.
*WILLARD FISKE	
J. B. FLETCHER	New York, N.Y.
J. D. M. FORD	Cambridge, Mass.
MRS. J. D. M. FORD	Cambridge, Mass.
ABBOTT FOSTER	New York, N.Y.
B. A. G. FULLER	Cambridge, Mass.
EDWIN B. GAGER	Derby, Conn.
MRS. JOHN L. GARDNER	Boston, Mass.
WILLIAM AMORY GARDNER	Groton, Mass.

* Deceased.

LIST OF MEMBERS

vii

MISS JULIA GEORGE	San Francisco, Cal.
*JAMES GILMORE	
C. H. GRANDGENT	Cambridge, Mass.
MRS. JOHN C. GRAY	Boston, Mass.
SIDNEY GUNN	Cambridge, Mass.
*W. T. HARRIS	
A. B. HART	Cambridge, Mass.
R. L. HAWKINS	Cambridge, Mass.
*MRS. ALFRED HEMENWAY	
MRS. HENRY L. HIGGINSON	Boston, Mass.
*T. W. HIGGINSON	
*E. B. HOLDEN	
EDWARD J. HOLMES	Boston, Mass.
MRS. EDWARD J. HOLMES	Boston, Mass.
MISS M. H. JACKSON	Wellesley, Mass.
HENRY JOHNSON	Brunswick, Maine
*FREEMAN M. JOSSELYN	
MRS. DAVID P. KIMBALL	Boston, Mass.
P. C. KNAPP	Boston, Mass.
MRS. P. C. KNAPP	Boston, Mass.
THEODORE W. KOCH	Washington, D.C.
WILLIAM C. LANE	Cambridge, Mass.
HENRY R. LANG	New Haven, Conn.
ERNEST F. LANGLEY	Cambridge, Mass.
RICHARD LAUKHUFF	Cleveland, Ohio
*HENRY C. LEA	
MORITZ LEVI	Ann Arbor, Mich.
*CHARLTON T. LEWIS	
MISS ALICE W. LONGFELLOW	Cambridge, Mass.
*HENRY W. LONGFELLOW	
*MRS. MORRIS LONGSTRETH	
MISS GEORGINA LOWELL	Boston, Mass.
*JAMES RUSSELL LOWELL	

* Deceased.

MISS ELLEN F. MASON	Boston, Mass.
F. J. MATHER, JR.	New York, N.Y.
KENNETH MCKENZIE	New Haven, Conn.
*LUIGI MONTI	
CLIFFORD H. MOORE	Cambridge, Mass.
LEWIS F. MOTT	New York, N.Y.
MARTIN MOWER	Cambridge, Mass.
*JAMES J. MYERS	
*B. H. NASH	
*C. E. NORTON	
MISS GRACE NORTON	Cambridge, Mass.
MISS SARA NORTON	Ashfield, Mass.
C. G. PAGE	Boston, Mass.
C. H. PAGE	Hanover, N.H.
*T. W. PARSONS	
MISS LUCY A. PATON	Cambridge, Mass.
ARTHUR S. PEASE	Urbana, Ill.
*THEODORE C. PEASE	
MISS CATHERINE M. PHILLIMORE	London, England
CHANDLER RATHFON POST	Cambridge, Mass.
*M. A. POTTER	
R. RADCLIFFE-WHITEHEAD	Woodstock, N.Y.
E. K. RAND	Cambridge, Mass.
MRS. AURELIA H. REINHARDT	Berkeley, Cal.
*MISS JULIA A. DE RHAM	
F. N. ROBINSON	Cambridge, Mass.
MRS. F. N. ROBINSON	Cambridge, Mass.
MRS. HÉLOISE DURANT ROSE	New City, N.Y.
G. H. SAVAGE	Newark, N.J.
MRS. EBEN G. SCOTT	Wilkesbarre, Pa.
MISS MARY AUGUSTA SCOTT	Northampton, Mass.
MISS THEODORA SEDGWICK	Cambridge, Mass.
LUCIAN SHARPE	Cambridge, Mass.

* Deceased.

LIST OF MEMBERS

ix

E. S. SHELDON	Cambridge, Mass.
K. C. M. SILLS	Brunswick, Maine
CARROLL SMYTH	Philadelphia, Pa.
MISS KATHARINE V. SPENCER	Cambridge, Mass.
MERRITT STARR	Chicago, Ill.
C. CHAUNCEY STILLMAN	New York, N.Y.
CLARENCE STRATTON	St. Louis, Mo.
T. RUSSELL SULLIVAN	Boston, Mass.
G. L. SWIGGETT	Sewanee, Tenn.
WILLIAM R. THAYER	Cambridge, Mass.
MISS HELEN E. THOMPSON	Northampton, Mass.
*MISS ANNA E. TICKNOR	
HENRY A. TODD	New York, N.Y.
MARVIN R. VINCENT	New York, N.Y.
MARS E. WAGAR	Cleveland, Ohio
*E. L. WALTER	
RAYMOND WEEKS	New York, N.Y.
BARRETT WENDELL	Boston, Mass.
G. B. WESTON	Cambridge, Mass.
*MRS. HENRY WHITMAN	
ERNEST H. WILKINS	Chicago, Ill.
*JUSTIN WINSOR	
JOHN WOODBURY	Boston, Mass.
FRANCIS WYATT	New York, N.Y.
MISS MARY V. YOUNG	South Hadley, Mass.
C. D. ZDANOWICZ	Madison, Wis.

* Deceased.

STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS

(From May 19, 1914, to May 18, 1915)

Balance in the hands of the Treasurer, May	
19, 1914	\$946.04
Members' fees till May 18, 1915	495.00
Sales of Fay Concordance	12.00
Sale of Sheldon Concordance	7.20
Interest	<u>21.38</u>
	\$1481.62
Payments to Ginn and Company	\$359.65
Payments to the Treasurer of Harvard College	200.00
Refunded from sales of Fay Concordance	12.00
Printing, postage, etc.	19.65
Balance on hand May 18, 1915	<u>890.32</u>
	\$1481.62

BY-LAWS

1. This Society shall be called the DANTE SOCIETY. Its object shall be the encouragement of the study of the Life and Works of Dante.

2. Any person desirous to become a member of this Society may do so by signifying his or her wish in writing to the Secretary, and by the payment of an annual fee of five dollars.

3. An Annual Meeting for the election of officers shall be held at Cambridge on the third Tuesday of May, of which due notice shall be given to the members by the Secretary.

4. Special meetings may be held at any time appointed by vote of the members at the Annual Meeting, or by call from the President and Secretary.

5. The officers shall be a President, a Vice President, a Secretary and Treasurer, and a Librarian, who, together with three members thereto chosen, shall form the Council of the Society. All these officers shall be chosen at the Annual Meeting, and their term of service shall be for one year, or until their successors are elected. Vacancies in the Council shall be filled for the remainder of the year by the Council.

6. The President, or, in his absence, the Vice President, or, in the absence of both, any member of the Council, shall preside at all meetings of the Society and of the Council.

7. The Secretary and Treasurer shall keep a record of the meetings of the Society and of the Council, shall collect and receive all dues, and keep accounts of the income and expenditure of the Society, shall give notice of meetings, and shall perform all other duties appropriate to his office.

8. The Council shall hold meetings at such times as it may appoint, shall determine on the use to be made of the income of the Society, shall endeavor to promote the special objects of the Society in such ways as may seem most appropriate, and shall make an annual report of their

proceedings, including a full statement of accounts, at each Annual Meeting. This report shall be made in print for distribution to the members.

9. No officer of the Society shall be competent to contract debts in the name of the Society, and no expenditure shall be made without a vote of the Council.

10. A majority of the Council shall form a quorum for the transaction of business.

11. Any person distinguished for his interest in the purposes of the Society, or who has rendered it valuable service, may be chosen an Honorary Member at any regular meeting of the Society, and shall be entitled to all its privileges without annual assessment.

12. The preceding rules may be changed at any time by unanimous vote of the Council.

THE DANTE PRIZE

The Society offers an annual prize of one hundred dollars for the best essay by a student in any department of Harvard University, or by a graduate of not more than three years' standing, on a subject drawn from the life or works of Dante. The competition is open to students and graduates of similar standing of any college or university in the United States.

For the year 1915-1916 the following subjects were proposed :

1. *A study of the vocabulary of Dante's Lyrics.*
2. *The classification of Dante's Miscellaneous Lyrics.*
3. *The influence of Boethius on the Vita Nuova and the Convito.*
4. *A discussion of the authorship of Il Fiore.*
5. *A study of Dante's influence upon English literature (or upon any single author or period).*
6. *The relation of Dante's theological doctrines to the present teachings of the Church of Rome.*
7. *The relation of modern scientific discovery to Dante's conception of the divine order of the universe.*
8. *The main reasons for the increase of interest in the Divina Commedia during the past fifty years.*
9. *Dante and Cecco d'Ascoli.*
10. *A study of the decline of Dante's influence in Italy in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.*
11. *Modern traits in Dante.*
12. *Dante in the anecdotic literature of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries.*
13. *The influence of Guido Cavalcanti on Dante.*
14. *A criticism of Torraca's edition of the Divina Commedia.*

Essays must be deposited with the Dean of Harvard College Cambridge, Mass., on or before the *first day of May*.

Essayists are at liberty to write on any one of the subjects which have been proposed in the years during which the Dante Prize has been offered, or to propose new subjects for the approval of the Council of the Society.

On the title-page must be written an assumed name and a statement of the writer's standing, i.e. whether he is a graduate or an undergraduate (and of what college or university); if he is an undergraduate, to what class he belongs, and to what department of the college or university. Under cover with the essay must be sent a sealed letter containing the true name and address of the writer, and superscribed with his assumed name.

The essays must be written upon letter paper, of good quality, of the quarto size, with a margin of not less than one inch at the top, at the bottom, and on each side, so that they may be bound up without injury to the writing. The sheets on which the essay is written must be securely stitched together.

The judges of the essays are a committee of the Dante Society.

In case the judges decide that no essay submitted to them deserves the full prize, they are at liberty to award one or two prizes of fifty dollars, or to award no prize.

The Dante Society has the privilege of retaining and depositing in the Dante Collection of the Harvard College Library any or all essays offered in competition for the Dante Prize, whether successful or not.

Since its establishment the Dante Prize (in full or in part) has been awarded to the following persons :

HEINRICH CONRAD BIERWIRTH 1887

For an essay entitled *Dante's Obligations to the Schoolmen, especially to Thomas Aquinas*.

GEORGE RICE CARPENTER 1888

For an essay entitled *The Interpretation and Reconciliation of the Different Accounts of his Experiences after the Death of Beatrice, given by Dante in the Vita Nuova and the Convito*.

CHARLES STERRETT LATHAM 1890

For an essay entitled *A Translation into English of Dante's Letters, with Explanatory and Historical Comments*.

KENNETH MCKENZIE 1894

For an essay entitled *The Rise of the Dolce Stil Nuovo*.

JEREMIAH DENIS MATTHIAS FORD 1895

For an essay entitled *Dante's Influence upon Spanish Literature during the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries*.

ANNETTE FISKE 1897

For an essay entitled *Dante's Obligations to Old French and Provençal Lyric Poetry*.

ARTHUR NEWTON PEASLEE 1900

For an essay entitled *A Metrical Rhyming Translation of the Three Canzoni of the Convito*.

HENRY LATIMER SEAVER 1901

For an essay entitled *A Translation of the Canzoni in the Convito*.

ALAIN CAMPBELL WHITE 1902

The Latham Prize for an essay entitled *A Translation of the Quaestio de Aqua et Terra, and a Discussion of its Authenticity*.

ALPHONSO DE SALVIO 1902

For an essay entitled *The Verse Endings in the Divina Commedia in which Dante has made "li vocaboli dire nelle sue rime altro che quello ch' erano appo gli altri dicatori usati di sprimere."*

FRITZ HAGENS 1903

For an essay entitled *A Critical Comment of the De Vulgari Eloquentia*.

CHANDLER RATHFON POST 1906

For an essay entitled *The Beginnings of the Influence of Dante in Castilian and Catalan Literature*.

ALEXANDER GUY HOLBORN SPIERS 1907

For an essay entitled *Characteristics of the Vita Nuova*.

RALPH HAYWARD KENISTON 1909

For an essay entitled *The Dante Tradition in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries*.

ROGER THEODORE LAFFERTY 1912

For an essay entitled *The Philosophy of Dante*.

GEORGE HUSSEY GIFFORD 1913

For an essay entitled *Expressions of Gratitude in Dante*.

RICHARD AGER NEWHALL 1914

For an essay entitled *Italian Ghibellinism as reflected in Dante*.

AMOS PHILIP McMAHON 1915

For an essay entitled *On Dante's De Monarchia. A Study of Imperialism in Mediæval and in Modern Times*.

ANNUAL REPORT

The thirty-fourth annual meeting of the Society was held on May 18, 1915, at the house of Miss Katharine Vaughan Spencer, Craigie Street, Cambridge. In the absence of President Sheldon, the Vice President, Professor Charles Hall Grandgent, occupied the chair. The usual reports were received and the regular routine business transacted.

A communication was received from Professor Sheldon saying that he should be unable to serve the Society longer as President, and Professor Grandgent was elected in his place. Mr. William Roscoe Thayer was chosen Vice President, and the place thus made vacant on the Council was filled by the election of Professor Chandler Rathfon Post. The remaining officers were reëlected.

Announcement was made of the award of the Dante Prize to Mr. Amos Philip McMahon, for a study of the *De Monarchia* in its relation to certain ideals of imperialism in modern times.

At the conclusion of the business meeting Professor Grandgent spoke briefly of current publications relating to Dante and read selections from Mr. Henry Johnson's translation of the *Divine Comedy*. Professor Rand read a paper on "Dante and Servius," which has since been printed to accompany the Thirty-Third Report.

The Council takes pleasure in publishing with the present report a paper by Dr. Charles Edward Whitmore on "The Lyrics of Fazio degli Uberti in their Relation to Dante" and "Three Dante Notes" by Professor Ernest Hatch Wilkins.

FRED NORRIS ROBINSON

Secretary

CAMBRIDGE, March 10, 1917

THE LYRICS OF FAZIO DEGLI UBERTI IN THEIR RELATION TO DANTE

BY CHARLES EDWARD WHITMORE

Fazio degli Uberti, both by virtue of his historical position and in his own right as a lyric poet, is an important figure in Italian literature of the Trecento. For a proper understanding of his worth on both counts, an exact knowledge of his relation to Dante is of prime importance. That he was intimately acquainted with Dante's work, and in close sympathy with his general attitude, is a statement requiring no elaborate proof; but it is worth while to ascertain just what he chose to take over from Dante, and just what use he made of it. He marks a new stage in the development of Italian lyric, deriving certain motives and phrases from Dante, but utilizing them for ends of his own. Moreover, he had before him not only Dante's lyrics, but the great fabric of the *Commedia*; and the tracing of the influence of the latter, as it passes into the field of lyric, will be not the least interesting part of our discussion. Fazio's *Dittamondo* has long served as the chief document of his knowledge of the *Commedia*, and has already been studied in that connection;¹ but the reflex of the *Commedia* on his lyrics, and their relation to the *Canzoniere* of his supreme predecessor, have thus far awaited the detailed examination which I here propose to give them.

The present study is based on a concordance to the lyrics of Fazio, completed by me, early in 1915, from Renier's critical edition. I have in practically all cases accepted his text, as well as his canon and arrangement of Fazio's authentic poems. Dr. Ezio Levi's ingenious attempt² to deprive Fazio of the "canzone di Roma" (no. xii) has not convinced me. This is not the place for a refutation of his arguments, which, in any

¹ See Achille Pellizzari, *Il Dittamondo e la Divina Commedia*, Pisa, 1905.

² See *L'Autore della "Canzone di Roma,"* in *Poesia di Popolo e Poesia di Corte nel Trecento*, Livorno, 1915.

case, those who desire can easily review for themselves; but I may remark that the internal evidence of the poem, which Dr. Levi is inclined to ignore, seems to me decisive in favor of Fazio's authorship. Citations from Dante are drawn from the Oxford text, with the exclusion of certain obviously unauthentic pieces. They are: the seventeenth canzone, *Morte, poich' io non truovo a cui mi doglia*, really by Jacopo Cecchi; the eighteenth, *O patria degna di trionfal fama*, surely not by Dante, whoever may have been the true author; and the palpably apocryphal *Salmi* and *Credo*. Questions of authenticity in the scattered sonnets and ballate do not much concern us, since few parallels to them are to be found in Fazio, who, indeed, is not conspicuously a sonneteer, and, so far as we know, wrote no ballate.

Fazio's poems may be roughly divided into three groups. First, and on the whole most excellent, are the love poems, canzoni ii to viii inclusive; second, and not much inferior, the political poems, canzoni xi, xii, and xiv, and the frottola, to which may be added the historical canzoni, xv and xvi; and third, a miscellaneous group, of a didactic or moralizing cast, canzoni i, ix, x, and xiii, with the sonnets on the seven deadly sins. Certain minor poems will receive only incidental mention. It will be helpful, I think, to take up these groups in order, treating first their relations to Dante's lyrics, and then their connection with the *Commedia*. A discussion of parallel passages is at best hard to keep in coherent shape, and a certain amount of crossing between groups seems unavoidable; but I shall endeavor to make the bearings of the different parts of the paper as intelligible as I can.

I

The general relation of Fazio's love poems to those of Dante is easily pointed out. Fazio has nothing to do with the scholastic aspects of the *dolce stil nuovo*, or with what we may call its technical vocabulary. He wholly neglects, for instance, the apparatus of personified *spiriti*, and the importance attached to such words as *umiltà* and *salute*. Indeed, it is significant that the sole passage in Fazio which verges on the "scientific" sense of *spirito* immediately applies it to the birds in spring:

Che vivi spiritelli
Paion d' amor, creati alla verdura (*Canz.* v, 22).

Fazio, in short, is no philosopher, but a keen observer of the visible world. As a natural consequence, he is most strongly influenced by the poems in which Dante shows himself least philosophical, and closest to actual experience. We should therefore expect two of Dante's canzoni, the "winter song," *Io son venuto al punto della rota* (xv), and the "song of the harsh speech," *Così nel mio parlar voglio esser aspro* (xii), to be among Fazio's favorites; and that is precisely the case. The first of these, in fact, is followed by Fazio with a closeness paralleled in no other instance; so that our survey may fitly take this closely matched pair as its point of departure.

The canzone of Fazio's in question is his fifth, *Io guardo fra l'erbette per li prati*, which reproduces the central idea of the "winter song" — the contrast of the lover's state with the phenomena of a season, in this case spring instead of winter. The metrical form of Fazio's canzone is the same, except for the insertion of a seven-syllable line after the second and fifth lines of the original stanza; the division of each stanza between external description and emotion of the writer is also maintained, the latter occupying, in both poems, the last four lines of every stanza. As regards substance, however, Fazio is by no means a mere copyist; he selects and rejects according to the needs of a design of his own. Broadly speaking, the relation of individual stanzas is as follows. The first of Fazio's corresponds to the fourth of Dante's; the second, to the first part of Dante's third; the third, to the second part of Dante's third; the fourth, to the first part of Dante's fifth; the fifth has no parallel in Dante. Fazio, that is, rejects the astronomical and meteorological details with which Dante begins; he transposes the imagery of winter to that of spring, sometimes with a counterpart of Dante's phrasing, sometimes in his own terms; and he adds the final picture of youths and maidens dancing amid the forest. The mode of vision of the two poets is likewise radically distinct. Dante sees the great natural forces and their result — the storm wind, the frozen soil, the "great assault of winter." Fazio's attention is directed almost wholly to the concrete details of springtime — the budding flowers, the nesting birds, the flowing streams, the whole color and movement of the new season. Dante sees each step sharply, sets it down, and then turns to the next in order; Fazio's glance passes rapidly over his whole scene, never rising far above its visible components, but keeping his items well in hand, so that each stanza is

definitely composed, with no hint of the *pastiche*. It is perhaps not a vain conjecture that Dante's own words in his *commiato*:

or che sarà di me nell' altro
Dolce tempo novello,

may have given Fazio his first impulse to composition; but he is quite able to proceed on his own account. If his poem lacks the tremendous concentration and weightiness of Dante's, it has a fresh picturesqueness that is all its own; if its general outward aspect frankly recalls that of its model, its final effect is none the less definite and original.

The following passages will serve to show the transposed phrases referred to above. Lines 2-4 of Fazio,

E veggio isvariar di più colori
Gigli, viole e fiori,
Per la virtù del sol, che fuor gli tira,

correspond to lines 40-42 of Dante:

Passato hanno lor termine le fronde
Che trasse fuor la virtù d' Ariete
Per adornare il mondo, e morta è l' erba;

lines 16-21 of Fazio,

Veggio li uccelli a due a due volare
E l' un l' altro seguir tra gli arboscelli,
Con far nidi novelli,
Trattando con vaghezza lor natura,
E sento ogni boschetto risonare
Dai dolci canti lor,

to lines 27-32 of Dante:

Fuggito è ogni augel, che 'l caldo segue,
Dal paese d' Europa, che non perde
Le sette stelle gelide unquemaï;
E gli altri han posto alle lor voci triegue
Per non sonarle infino al tempo verde,
Se ciò non fosse per cagion di guai;

lines 39-41 of Fazio,

E così par costretto
Ogni animal che 'n su la terra è scorto
In questo primo tempo a seguir gioia,

to lines 33-35 of Dante :

E tutti gli animali, che son gai
Di lor natura, son d'amor disciolti,
Perocchè il freddo lor spirito ammorta ;

and lines 46-47 of Fazio,

Surgono chiare e fresche le fontane,
L'acqua spargendo giù per la campagna,

to lines 53-54 of Dante :

Versan le vene le fumifere acque
Per li vapor che la terra ha nel ventre.

It will be noted that Fazio passes over the scientific touches, with an eye solely to the natural object, which he has evidently observed at first hand, and which he presents as he has seen it.

The *canzone* of the "harsh speech," though not the model for any single *canzone* or extended passage, has left its mark in several places. Dante tells us how he longs to make spoil of his lady's tresses (63-65) :

Che ne' biondi capelli,
Ch' Amor per consumarmi increspa e dora,
Metterei mano e sazieremi allora ;

so Fazio, in milder terms, expresses a similar wish (*Canz.* iii, 14) :

Sicch' io potessi quella treccia bionda
Disfarla a onda a onda,
E far de' suoi begli occhi a' miei due specchi,
Che lucon sì che non trovan parecchi,

the last two lines recalling a passage of Dante somewhat farther on (74-76) :

E i suoi begli occhi, ond' escon le faville
Che m' infiammano il cor ch' io porto anciso,
Guarderei presso e fiso.

"S' io avessi le bionde treccie prese," says Dante,

Con esse passerei vespro e le squille ;

and for Fazio in the contemplation of his lady (*Canz.* iv, 72),

Niente m'è a passar vespro e le squille —

practically a direct quotation. In *Canz.* vi, 5,

amore in vista tanto adorna
Dell' intelletto mio prese la cima,

says Fazio ;

Così della mia mente tien la cima

is the parallel phrase in Dante (17). Fazio's metaphorical use of *pietra* in line 32 of the same canzone may also be regarded as a reminiscence of the *rime pietrose*. We may also note a parallel in Fazio's ninth sonnet.

Per me credea che 'l suo forte arco Amore
Avesse steso, e chiusa la faretra,

he begins ; but the hope is vain, for

Colla saetta d' or, che non si arretra,
M' aperse il petto, e fessi mio signore.

Here we are reminded of lines 6-8 in Dante :

perch' ella s' arretra,
Non esce di faretra
Saetta.

A number of scattered reminiscences are drawn from Dante's eleventh canzone, *Amor, dacchè convien pur ch' io mi doglia*, likewise one of those belonging to his later work. The following passage from Fazio's fourth canzone (99 ff.),

E ciò sarebbe all' alma mia gran pianto
Se scolorasse alquanto ;
Come colei che dopo morte spera
Ch' i' l' andrò a veder dov' ella è vera,

recalls two passages in Dante's : the first, lines 14-15 :

Che se intendesse ciò ch' io dentro ascolto,
Pieta faria men bello il suo bel volto ;

the second, the last two lines of 31-35 :

La nemica figura che rimane
Vittoriosa e fera,
E signoreggia la virtù che vuole,
Vaga di sè medesma andar mi fane
Colà dov' ella è vera.

The first three of these, in turn, have perhaps a feeble echo in Fazio viii, 33 :

E più la sua vittoria
Di sopra alla mia vita sento crescere.

Another fairly close parallel is Dante, lines 46-47 :

Qual io divegna sì feruto, Amore,
Sal tu contar, non io,

and Fazio ii, 42-44 :

Quel ch'io di lei credeva,
E con quanti sospiri e pensier fui,
Dicalo Amor, ch'io nol so dire altrui.

Finally, the metaphor in Dante, line 37 :

Ben conosch'io che va la neve al sole,

reappears in Fazio v, 28 :

Ch'io mi distruggo come al sol la neve,

though it is indeed not so recondite as to need the stimulus of Dante's line to suggest it.

The passages thus far discussed show that Fazio was chiefly drawn to three canzoni of Dante which represent him in his more realistic mood. As we have already noted, that mood was more akin to Fazio's own than is the exalted and mystical strain of Dante's earlier work ; and we accordingly find that Fazio makes few direct drafts on the *Vita Nuova*, the general tone of which is not in accord with his own mode of thought. As close a relation as we can find seems to lie between these lines of Fazio vii, 77 ff.:

Gli occhi e la bocca e ogni biltà tua
Non fece Iddio perchè venisser meno,
Ma per mostrare a pieno
A noi l' esempio della gloria sua,

and lines 49-50 of the first canzone of the *Vita Nuova* :

Ella è quanto di ben può far natura ;
Per esempio di lei beltà si prova.

It will be noted that Fazio's phrasing is less lofty, and more concrete. An occasional phrase from the *Vita Nuova* seems in other cases to have remained in Fazio's memory. Thus the *donne e donzelle* to whom Dante

declares the praise of Beatrice find a place in Fazio, but as figures in a setting, not as *confidentes*. Again, the *color di perla quasi informa* attributed by Dante to his lady (*Vita Nuova*, canz. i, 47), reappears in Fazio's description of his,

Con un color angelica di perla (*Canz.* iii, 62).

Feebler echoes — the unsympathetic might call them parodies — are perhaps heard in two other cases.

Farei parlando innamorar la gente,

says Dante at the beginning of the same canzone; so Fazio, at the beginning of his fourth:

Che non che i nostri cuor, ma que' de' draghi
Farei udendo appaghi,
E per le selve innamorar gli uccelli.

The *pioggia di manna* of the second canzone of the *Vita Nuova* may have been in Fazio's mind in these lines (vii, 57):

E par neve che fiocchi
Dal tuo bel viso l' amorosa manna
Colla qual cibi li spiriti miei.

Such is the rather scanty evidence (except for one case to be noted later) of Fazio's contact with the *Vita Nuova*; and, as a natural corollary, we find in him no sure reminiscences of *E' m' incresce di me sì duramente* (xiii) and *La dispietata mente che pur mira* (xvi), which are commonly held to belong to the *Vita Nuova* period.

A considerable passage in Fazio's third canzone (74 ff.) shows direct relations with the second canzone of the *Convivio*, the topic in both being the praise of the poet's lady. Fazio's lines run:

guardi la mente tua
Ben fisamente allor ch' ella s' indua
Con donna che leggiadra e bella sia.
E come muore e par che fugga via
Dinnanzi al sole ogni altra chiarezza,
Così costei ogni adornezza isface.
Vedi se ella piace,
Ch' amore è tanto quant' è sua bellezza,
Ed è somma bontà che in lei si trova.

So Dante, lines 39-40 :

E qual donna gentil questa non crede,
Vada con lei e miri gli atti sui ;

and again, lines 49-50 :

Gentil è in donna ciò che in lei si trova,
E bello è tanto, quanto lei somiglia.

Moreover, lines 55 and 56 in Dante :

Cose appariscon nello suo aspetto
Che mostran de' piacer del Paradiso,

may have been in Fazio's mind when he wrote lines 46-48 :

Che sol per le belle opre
Che fanno in cielo il sole e l'altre stelle,
Dentro di lor si crede il Paradiso,

though the turn of thought is not the same.

In addition to the fairly extensive similarities which we have thus far considered, it is worth while to note certain lines of Dante which seem to have remained in Fazio's memory, and to have determined the cadence or choice of words in a verse of his own. The noting of such cases is bound to be somewhat subjective ; but the following will show the sort of relation involved. Dante xiv, 11 :

E questo è quello ond' io prendo cordoglio,

seems to recur in bisected shape, thus :

Poi non vorrei che *prendesse cordoglio* (iv, 94)

and

E questo è quello ond' io più forte dubito (viii, 14),

a similarity which I cannot think accidental. So *Convivio* iii, 131,

E solo in lealtà far si diletta,

recalls the cadence of Fazio iii, 85 :

E solo in suo ben far prende speranza.

To multiply similar citations would be to risk falling into arbitrary juxtapositions ; but the point is worth making as a further indication of the extent to which Fazio had digested the phraseology of Dante's lyrics, and made it an intimate part of his own means of expression.

The relations between the love poems of our two poets may thus be summarized as follows : Fazio draws chiefly from Dante's later and less

scholastic work, with a consequent disregard of the *Vita Nuova* and its related poems. In but one case does he use any single canzone of Dante's as the basis for one of his own, and in that his work is a continuation rather than a copy. In taking over a suggestion from Dante he seldom reproduces it literally, but tends either to combine two passages in one of his own, or to reflect a single passage in two distinct places; he likewise often modifies the application of what he transfers. He also tends to diminish the intensity of what he takes over; to adapt the terminology of the *De Vulgari Eloquentia*, he is elegiac where Dante is tragic; but he never, I think, lapses into sentimentality.

That Fazio's political poems should be widely affected by Dante's lyrics is scarcely to be expected, the character of the latter not being susceptible of a transfer to poems dealing with the political conditions of Fazio's own day. Yet so close a student as Fazio could not fail to carry over an occasional phrase; and his twelfth canzone, which is in a sense transitional between his poems of love and those of a political cast, has several reminiscences of Dante's love poems. The whole tone of the opening, for some thirty lines, is decidedly Dantesque, and several direct parallels occur. The very first line,

recalls Quella virtù che 'l terzo ciel infonde,

Ch' infonde sempre in lei la sua virtute

of *Convivio* ii, 28, and the *gran pianeta* of *Canz.* xix, 96, which

con li bei raggi infonde
Vita e virtù.

Fazio has been the servant of her

Che ne' suoi occhi porta la mia pace;

so Dante, in *Canz.* ix, 60,

Nè che negli occhi porta la mia pace.

Later, at the beginning of stanza 7, occurs another reminiscence of this same ninth canzone, consecutive on the one just given.

Onor ti sarà grande, se m' aiuti,
E a me ricco dono,

are Dante's words; Fazio's,

Onor ti sarà grande, e a me stato,
Se per tuo operar son consolata.



Just why these three consecutive lines stayed in Fazio's memory may be hard to explain; but the fact seems undeniable.¹

Of all Dante's moralizing canzoni, the twentieth, *Tre donne intorno al cor mi son venute*, has left the strongest impress on Fazio's work. Its double character — partly a vision, partly an expression of Dante's personal attitude — has resulted in a double influence. In the vigorous *commiato* of Fazio xiv :

E se pure t' avviene
Che veggi quel che la tua rima tocca,
Apri la bocca, e dillo tutto intero,

we are reminded of Dante's

Pianganlo gli occhi e dolgasi la bocca
Degli uomini a cui tocca.

But Fazio's love poems, too, show some reflex of the passage (lines 81 ff.) which alludes to Dante's absence from his lady :

E se non che degli occhi miei 'l bel segno
Per lontananza m'è tolto dal viso,
Che m'have in fuoco miso,
Lieve mi conterei ciò che m'è grave;
Ma questo fuoco m'have
Già consumato sì l'ossa e la polpa.

The idea of absence is to be found in Fazio, *Canz.* v, 72 and xii, 5; with the fourth line of the Dante passage compare Fazio iv, 4 :

Per dolci bramerei i colpi amari,

with the sixth, Fazio vii, 13 :

Se non ch' i' consumava ogni ossa e nerbo.

Another part of Fazio iv seems to reflect Dante's line 53,

Mirando sè nella chiara fontana,

Fazio's words being

Per *mirar* lei sotto li vaghi cigli,
Come Atteon per ritrovar Diana
Nella chiara fontana (47-49).

The same canzone furnishes, in a general way, the model for Fazio's fifteenth, *O sommo bene, o glorioso Iddio*, which is likewise a vision,

¹ Fazio has the phrase *onore e dono* in *Canz.* xi, 13.

though of a less effective sort. Just as Love, in Dante's canzone, on seeing the first lady pitied her, and

Di lei e del dolor fece dimanda,

so Fazio questions the mournful figure who appears to him :

Non men che la pietà era il disiro
Di spiar del suo stato e sì del pianto ;
Ond' io mi trassi alquanto
Più verso lei e di ciò la richiesi.

Otherwise the conduct of the two poems is not very similar ; but one fairly striking likeness of phrase occurs,

Vedove e pupilli ed innocenti
Del mio sangue miglior van per lo pane
Per altrui terre strane (86-88),

which obviously recalls Dante's

Larghezza e Temperanza e l' altre nate
Del nostro sangue mendicando vanno (63-64),

with a shift of application characteristic, as we have seen, of Fazio's manner.

The remaining parallels to be found in the political group are scattering, and of minor significance. Line 100 of Dante x :

Se ben si guarda là dov' io addito,

appears, condensed, in line 29 of the frottola,

Se guardi ov' io addito.

In *Canz.* xix, 77,

Ancorchè ciel con cielo in punto sia,

says Dante ; so Fazio begins his address to Ludwig of Bavaria (xi, 1),

Tanto son volti i ciel di parte in parte,

and later declares that Ludwig shall see himself

giunto
Imperador co' cieli a sì buon punto.

These are obviously slight ; and the sixteenth canzone shows no affiliations with Dante's lyrics whatever. We may safely say that these political

poems show only such resemblances as were inevitable in view of Fazio's intimate knowledge of his predecessor.

For analogous reasons, and to an even greater degree, Fazio's moralizing poems show few points of contact with Dante's *canzoniere*. Dante, in his poems of that type, is the subtle scholastic reasoner, who, "with harsh and subtle rime," presses home the analysis of his topic. Fazio had neither the inclination nor the ability to be a "syllogizer of invidious verities"; his learning is chiefly in the way of historical or mythical citation and example, a procedure wholly foreign to the lyrical manner of the *dolce stil nuovo*. The full significance of this difference will appear later; for the present, we may simply list the scattering parallels which the third group of Fazio's poems affords.

Three of them, and these the closest, are drawn from Dante's tenth canzone, lines 121-122 of which,

Volge il donare in vender tanto caro
Quanto sa sol chi tal compera paga,

are condensed by Fazio in *Canz.* x, 32,

Quanto più costa, più car tener fassi,

applied to carnal love. Dante's picture of the miser (110)

Che sempre fugge l' esca,

has perhaps lent a phrase to the close of the sonnet on Lussuria (*Son.* vi, 13):

O quanto è da lodar l' uomo e la femina
Che fugge l' esca che per me si semina.

Finally, the opening of Fazio's thirteenth canzone,

L' utile intendo più che la rettorica,

recalls Dante's line 53,

Ma perocchè 'l mio dire util vi sia,

though the tone of Fazio's list of the qualifications of a good ruler is as remote from Dante's way of thought as can be imagined.

But one further case in this group need be mentioned — the reference to the *Vita Nuova* alluded to above. Fazio's first canzone, by far

the best of those in our third group, recounts his sufferings in his exiled and hapless life. It deals with a more sordid side of exile than any which Dante had to bear, and consequently differs in tone from anything of his; but its invocation of death is strikingly similar to that uttered by Dante in the fourth canzone of the *Vita Nuova*:

Anima mia, che non ten vai?

says Dante:

Che li tormenti che tu porterai
 Nel secol che t'è già tanto noioso
 Mi fan pensoso di paura forte;
 Ond' io chiamo la morte
 Come soave e dolce mio riposo.

So Fazio, full of discouragement and fear, turns imploringly to the same refuge:

I' chiamo, prego, lusingo la morte,
 Come divota, dolce, cara amica,
 Che non mi sia nimica,
 Ma venga a me come a sua propria cosa;

and her refusal leads him to the thought of self-destruction. The bitterness of his lot has brought him to a depth of despair to which Dante was never reduced, but gives his poem a sincerity which sets it apart from those of its age.

In these second and third groups, then, we find fewer points of contact with Dante's lyrics, a condition explained by radical differences in mode of thought. It is clear that Fazio did not draw on Dante's moralizing poems as if they made, to his mind, a distinct group; for references to them occur in his love poems, just as Dante's love poems lend some touches to Fazio's non-amorous verse. We may note that, had he been a mere imitator, he would scarcely have failed to copy the unusual metrical forms of Dante's moralizing canzoni, whereas in fact he does nothing of the kind. In the main he adheres to the general canons of stanza structure laid down by the poets of the *dolce stil nuovo*, the most conspicuous of his deviations being a fondness for a *pes* of four lines instead of one of three (ABbC instead of ABC, for instance), this four-line type occurring, with or without cross-rime, in fourteen out of the sixteen canzoni.

I have tried, in this discussion, to emphasize the certain cases of relationship between the lyrics of our two poets, and to set forth their exact nature; I have therefore passed over many minor coincidences of phrase, which may often be accidental, and which, if significant at all, must be treated on a broader basis than the work of two poets only. The passages here given show, I think, that Fazio deliberately chose such features as were in accord with his own poetic disposition, and that he wove them into a fabric of his own devising, by no means using them as substitutes for activity on his own part. If he is unmistakably influenced by Dante's lyrics, it is as a true follower, not as an imitator; and if that is the case here, it is equally so with his relation to the *Commedia*, to the examination of which we now turn.

II

We have already remarked that Fazio's knowledge of the *Commedia* must have been extensive and profound; but when we seek the reflex of that knowledge in his lyrics, we find it to be of a definite and rather limited sort. Fazio does not draw on the *Commedia* for beautiful passages and figures; practically none of Dante's similes are transferred, and the lines that are echoed seem to have been chosen for their content, rather than for their intrinsic beauty. It therefore follows that the most obvious borrowings are those containing some mythological or historical allusion. By far the greater number of the proper names in Fazio's lyrics occur also in the *Commedia*; but in most cases Fazio uses his own words in what he says of them. In the cases where he does not, he tends to follow Dante closely, as if he regarded him as an authority to be cited with exactness. It is thus fair to say that in such matters he uses Dante as a source of information; and further, that to the influence of the *Commedia* is in part due that infiltration of learned allusions which so sharply distinguishes the typical Trecento lyric from that of the *dolce stil nuovo*.

As a result of this state of affairs, the relation of Fazio's lyrics to the *Commedia* is practically the reverse of that subsisting between them and Dante's *canzoniere*. That is, the love poems show it least, the political and moralizing poems most—a perfectly natural result, as we have already suggested. In what we may regard as the earlier of the love

poems, echoes of the *Commedia* are faint and infrequent. It is true that the opening of the second canzone :

Nel tempo che s' infiora e cuopre d'erba
 La terra, sicchè mostra tutta verde,
 Vidi una donna andar per una landa,

 Per farsi una ghirlanda
 Ponevasi a sedere in su la sponda
 Dove batteva l' onda
 D' un fiumicello, e co' biondi capelli
 Legava fior qua' le parean più belli —

reminds us of Dante's dream of Leah in *Purg.* xxvii, 97 :

Giovane e bella in sogno mi parea
 Donna vedere andar per una landa
 Cogliendo fiori, e cantando dicea :
 Sappia, qualunque il mio nome domanda,
 Ch' io mi son Lia, e vo movendo intorno
 Le belle mani a farmi una ghirlanda.

At most, however, Dante's words are a mere point of departure, for the remainder of the canzone is in Fazio's most personal manner ; and when we note that he makes no use of the description of the Earthly Paradise, which he might so easily have adopted, it would appear that the resemblance between the two passages is somewhat casual, though it is fair to assume that the lines were running in Fazio's head when he began his own poem. Another similarity seems to me entirely fortuitous ; for in view of the context of *Inf.* xxiv, 48 :

sedendo in piuma
 In fama non si vien, nè sotto coltre —

it seems to me unlikely that *Canz.* vii, 32 :

Ch' i' ti vedessi mai sotto la coltre —

is a conscious reminiscence.

In two canzoni, however, the fourth and the sixth, learned allusions begin to creep in, and a consequent relation to the *Commedia* is established. Lines 9-13 of the former,

E' non sonâr con più diletto quegli
 D' Anfione co' quai movia le pietre,
 Nè di Mercurio a chiuder gli occhi ad Argo . . .
 Nè contro Marsia d' Apollo le cetre,

remind us of *Inf.* xxxii, 10,

Ma quelle donne aiutino il mio verso
 Ch' aiutaro Amfion a chiuder Tebe,

and of the invocation to Apollo, *Par.* i, 20,

Sì come quando Marsia traesti
 Della vagina delle membre sue.

Moreover, for the reference to Argus, with a suggestion of the opening lines of the canzone,

S' i' savessi formar quanto son begli
 Gli occhi di questa donna onesti e vaghi,

we may compare *Purg.* xxxii, 64,

S' io potessi ritrar come assonaro
 Gli occhi spietati, udendo di Siringa.

Here again, when Fazio has once poured out his erudition, he returns to his own natural vein, and ceases to echo.

Equally striking, for its exactness of citation, is a passage in *Canz.* vi, (20 ff.):

E così sono un altro Meleagro,
 E questa tien lo stizzo che fataro
 Le Tre, quando il trovaro,
 Ch' al suo piacer convien ch' io mi consumi,

which draws on *Purg.* xxv, 22 :

" Se t' ammentassi come Meleagro
 Si consumò al consumar d' un stizzo,
 Non fora," disse, " questo a te sì agro."

Fazio, too, rimes *Meleagro* with *agro* ; and this throws some light on his probable motive for introducing the allusion. The opening of the poem is based on the change of love's sweetness to bitterness, so that *agro* is a perfectly natural word in the development of the thought. Its introduction, however, puts Fazio in mind of Dante's words, some of which

he proceeds to utilize. I hold, therefore, that this particular allusion is not a chance bit of filling, but came to Fazio's mind as a direct consequence of his knowledge of the *Commedia*. How far the observation may be true of other like cases is perhaps debatable; personally, I think it applies to several of them, being another illustration of the fact that Fazio is not a copyist, but a follower.

Yet another example of this is the extent to which Fazio refrains from bodily transferring Dantesque similes, in proof of which three cases may be cited. The first is *Canz.* iv, 18 ff.:

Come per primavera innanzi il giorno
Ride Diana nell' aria serena
D' una luce sì piena
Che par che ne risplenda tutto il cielo,

which has a far-off likeness to *Par.* xxiii, 25:

Quale ne' plenilunii sereni
Trivia ride tra le ninfe eterne
Che dipingono il ciel per tutti i seni;

but the image is a perfectly natural one, appropriate to poetry in all ages. The other two occur in the fifth canzone; one an allusion to the lance of Peleus (59):

finchè 'l dolce sguardo
Non la risanerà d' un altro dardo,

a stock image in Provençal and early Italian lyric, standing in no need of suggestion by *Inf.* xxxi, 4:

Così odo io che soleva la lancia
D' Achille e del suo padre esser cagione
Prima di trista e poi di buona mancia.

The other is in lines 66 ff.:

Giuocando all' ombra delle gran foreste,
Tanto leggiadre e preste
Qual solean ninfe stare appresso i laghi,

which bears a somewhat closer relation to *Purg.* xxix, 4:

E come ninfe che si givan sole
Per le selvatiche ombre, disiando
Qual di veder, qual di fuggir, lo sole.

I have deliberately cited these cases — the most closely related that I could find — to show that where it is a question of poetic statement, as distinguished from learned allusion, Fazio is amply able to take his own course. It seems hardly necessary to list the passages in which Fazio and Dante allude to the same character, but in different terms; it is enough to say that in most of them Fazio very probably drew from the *Commedia*, as a convenient book of reference, but that he drew, after all, with a fair degree of moderation, when we consider the encyclopedic scope of his source.

A somewhat similar moderation is to be found in the political poems, in most of which Fazio is still in control of his powers. In the twelfth canzone, the allusions to Roman history are not couched in terms borrowed from Dante, the closest parallel which I have noted being line 69,

Finchè Tarquin fu da Bruto cacciato,

which recalls *Inf.* iv, 127 :

Vidi quel Bruto che cacciò Tarquino.

When Rome, seeking aid from her senate, finds on the threshold

Superbia, invidia, ed avarizia ria (124),

the quotation of *Inf.* vi, 74 :

Superbia, invidia, ed avarizia sono
Le tre faville,

is manifest. So lines 51-52,

Sotto lo sterpo mio, ch' ora si face
Di greve piombo, e di fuor ci par d' oro,

remind us of the copes of the hypocrites (*Inf.* xxiii, 64), dazzlingly gilded without, but all lead within.

The fourteenth canzone, the bitter invective against Charles of Luxemburg, shows signs of closer dependence, two of the initial curses finding marked parallels. The opening line,

Di quel possi tu ber che bevve Crasso,

suggests *Purg.* xx, 116,

Ultimamente ci si grida: Crasso,
Dicci, che il sai, di che sapore è l' oro?

The fifth,

Come a Mordret, il sol ti passi il casso,

is even closer to *Inf.* xxxii, 61, which is, indeed, almost needed as a gloss:

Non quelli a cui fu rotto il petto e l'ombra
Con esso un colpo per la man d' Artù.

The same may be said of two historical allusions: lines 49-50,

chi sconfisse
Brenno, Annibal e Pirro mise in caccia,

to be compared with *Par.* vi, 43, which tells of the Roman eagle,

portato dagli egregi
Romani incontro a Brenno, incontro a Pirro;

and line 85,

Fe' che le porte furo a Gian serrate,

corresponding to *Par.* vi, 80,

Con costui pose il mondo in tanta pace
Che fu serrato a Jano il suo delubro,

which also reminds us of *Canz.* xii, 49:

I qual col senno loro
Domaro il mondo e riformarlo in pace.

In view of the profusion of names in Justinian's speech in this canto of the *Paradiso*, we may indeed feel that Fazio has been moderate in his selection.

In the present part of our study it will prove more convenient to group canzoni xv and xvi with the moralizing poems; for in them, as the strain of original inspiration becomes weaker, the borrowings from the *Commedia* become more explicit and less modified. Thus, in the fifteenth, we have a simile of Dante's for once frankly and openly adopted — that of the frogs scattered by the serpent (*Inf.* ix, 76):

Come le rane innanzi alla nimica
Biscia per l'acqua si dileguan tutte,

which becomes in Fazio (90-91)

E questi, assai più crudi che serpenti,
Li scaccian, come biscie fan le rane.

It would seem that this particular figure struck a sympathetic chord in his fondness for a certain grotesqueness in the animal world, shown, for instance, in the picture of the enamored basilisks in the fifth canzone. At any rate, he uses it again in the description of Accidia (*Son.* vii, 7),

Gracido e muso come una ranocchia,

related to two passages in the *Inferno*:

E come all' orlo dell' acqua d' un fosso

Stanno i ranocchi pur col muso fuori (xxii, 25),

and

E come a gracidar si sta la rana

Col muso fuor dell' acqua (xxxii, 31).

Another passage of the same canzone shows a similar relationship.

Dico che nel mio prato

Di nuove piante son nati germogli

Ch' hanno aduggiato i gigli e la buon erba (60-62),

says the spirit of Florence, recalling the words of Hugh Capet (*Purg.* xx, 43),

Io fui radice della mala pianta

Che la terra cristiana tutta aduggia.

The first of these lines is made the basis of one of those "doublets" characteristic of Fazio.

Io fui radice della nobil pianta,

says Fiesole (*Canz.* xvi, 14); but the opening line of the sonnet on Pride runs:

Io son la mala pianta di superba.

Again, *Canz.* xv, 127:

E me latrando andar sì come belva,

suggests Dante's Hecuba (*Inf.* xxx, 20), who

Forsennata latrò sì come cane.

For a similar close likeness in the sixteenth canzone, we may cite lines 9-10:

Ma, per non trarre in tutto fuor la spola

Della mia tela,

comparing them with *Par.* iii, 95,

qual fu la tela

Onde non trasse infino a co' la spola.

As for the purely moralizing canzoni, their relations to the *Commedia* are rather of general tone than of particular parallels. The savage invective against carnal love (x) derives part of its vigorous vocabulary from that source; the list of hapless lovers in lines 57 ff. recalls that of *Inf.* v, 48; though the names are not throughout identical, there are *più di mille* in each case. There is also one explicit parallel, lines 16 ff.,

Così la lingua della strozza
Tratta di netta e mozza
Gli fosse stata,

suggested by *Inf.* xxviii, 101,

Con la lingua tagliata nella strozza.

The first canzone, which we have already seen to be independent of Dante's lyrics, is equally so of the *Commedia*, except perhaps for the imprecations of lines 40 ff.,

Però bestemmio prima la natura,
E poi fortuna, con chi n' ha podere
Di farmi sì dolere,

somewhat suggestive of *Inf.* iii, 103:

Bestemmiavan Iddio e lor parenti,
L' umana specie, il luogo, il tempo e il seme
Di lor semenza e di lor nascimenti.

When the so-called *disperata* became an established type, this order of topics was actually followed, no doubt rather consciously, as we see in Antonio da Ferrara's celebrated example; but Fazio's emotion was too strong and too sincere to be thus stereotyped.

One more likeness may be added to those which have already been incidentally cited from the sonnets on the deadly sins — the attitude of Sloth in *Son.* vii:

Per gran tristizia abbraccio le ginocchia,
E 'l mento su per esse sì trastulla,

which inevitably recalls that of Belacqua in *Purg.* iv, 107:

Sedeva ed abbracciava le ginocchia,
Tenendo il viso giù tra esse basso.

With this the list of really significant points of contact seems to close — of those, that is, which are neither so general as to be uncertain nor

so slight as to be without significance. I can find no indication that any special portion of the *Commedia* absorbed Fazio's attention ; at all events, the passages thus far considered are well distributed. Thirteen of them are drawn from the *Inferno*, seven from the *Purgatorio*, five from the *Paradiso*—a numerical relation which has, I think, nothing to surprise us.

In the order of Fazio's work, however, the influence of the *Commedia* tends to grow as Fazio's own powers diminish ; as he ceases to be a lyric poet in his own right, and becomes more and more absorbed in an antiquarian and moralizing turn of thought. His sixteenth canzone, which has no point of contact with Dante's lyrics, but several, as we have just seen, with the *Commedia*, clearly shows the accomplishment of the change in attitude. We must not forget, however, that here, as before, Fazio is no mere copyist ; if he makes a fairly close quotation, it is, I think, because he is actually quoting, because Dante has become an authority to be cited. When we think of the abundant similes which Fazio might have copied and did not, of the endless historical allusions which he refrained from utilizing, it is clear that he was far from abdicating his essential originality as a lyric poet, even in face of the *Commedia*.

III

In addition to the resemblances in substance and phrasing which we have thus far discussed, a few words may be devoted in conclusion to some general aspects of Fazio's vocabulary and style, which will help to complete our sense of the position he occupies, and to indicate a few more lines of Dante's influence on him. In handling these data I shall not attempt a rigidly exact enumeration, but shall be satisfied with statements sufficiently near exactness to give a fair idea of the matter in hand.

The vocabulary of Fazio's lyrics, omitting the inevitable prepositions and connectives, but without any close allowance for doublets (such as, for instance, *disfare* and *sfare*), amounts to some 1600 words, a very respectable total in proportion to the extent of his lyric work, and distinguished by a large percentage of words used but once, and a marked freedom from favorite epithets and stereotyped phrases. Of this total, all but some 240 are to be found in the *Commedia*, the "standardizing" influence of which is thus illustrated ; but the use which Fazio makes of them is mainly personal.

Of this remainder, many of course occur also in Dante's other works. Twenty-five are used by him in lyric; of these, *cera* in the sense of "countenance" occurs only in the doubtful sonnet xxix, *valoroso* in the probably unauthentic sonnet l. I list the remaining twenty-three for such interest as they may have; those preceded by an asterisk occur also in Dante's prose, the others only in his lyrics.

*adornezza	donzella	pino	*spiritello
cordoglio	faretra	*prudente	stocco
costumare	fatare	riscaldare	struggere
crespo	ghirlandetta	scampare	*tremore
crucioso	nutricare	servente	*virtuoso
*dardo	*piagare	sfare	

They are well distributed among Dante's lyrics, but do not seem to point to any special principle of choice.

Of greater interest is the list of forty words which Dante uses only in prose; for it illustrates the working of one of the forces which tended to widen the range of poetic vocabulary in the Trecento. It is as follows:

amabile	edificare	partecipare	recitare
apostolo	equità	pecunia	rettorica
arroganza	formoso	pertinace	scientifico
bassezza	generazione	piacevole	scure
calamita	genitore	potente	sfolgorato
calunnia	grammatico	pratico	senato
congiunto	incolpare	proverbio	sollecitudine
console	medicare	pupillo	sponere
costanza	moltitudine	purezza	stirpe
domanda	oltramare	pusillanimo	virile

Of these, *apostolo*, *congiunto*, *generazione*, *moltitudine*, and *recitare* occur in both *Vita Nuova* and *Convivio*, a total of five; *costanza*, *genitore*, *oltramare*, *piacevole*, and *sfolgorato* occur only in the *Vita Nuova*, another total of five; the remaining thirty occur only in the *Convivio*, a fact which would suggest that at least some of them seemed to Dante more appropriate to prose than to poetry.

If we now examine them to see why Fazio should have adopted them, we note at once that many of them would provide triple or *sdruciole* rimes, for which he has a marked fondness. It is to be noted that all

the words with two definite syllables after the accent (including the forms *calunnia*, *medica*, *participio*, and *sponere*) except *apostolo*, occur as such rimes; chiefly in *Canz.* viii, ix, and xiii, written in them throughout, but also incidentally in *Canz.* x (*multitudine*, *sollecitudine*). Rime of this type, as is well known, is practically nonexistent in the earlier Italian lyric; and it is conceivable that the few cases in the *Commedia*¹ gave Fazio his cue, which he then develops to an extreme degree.

It is also noteworthy that almost none of the words in this list occur in the love poems, the only exceptions being *formoso* (*Canz.* iii, 61), *calamita* (*Canz.* iv, 33), and *incolpare* (*ibid.* 91), none of them of a prosaic cast. We may therefore conclude that this element of Fazio's vocabulary was introduced for the following reasons: (1) to provide *sdruciole* rimes, often with rather grotesque effect;² (2) as historical terms, notably in *Canz.* xii (*console*, *scure*, *senato*); and (3) more or less as a matter of chance. The only case in which it seems likely that Fazio has been influenced by an actual prose expression in Dante is the phrase *vedove e pupilli*, which he uses twice, and which strongly recalls *Conv.* iv, 27, 118: "Ahi malastrui e malnati, che disertate vedove e pupilli." We may thus conclude that Fazio's later poems do show a gradual infusion of words which would earlier have been regarded as at all events more suited to prose, and that this infusion is due in part to the desire for more vigorous and unconventional expression, partly to a decline in taste, leading to the grotesque or the uninspired.

Lastly, two types of phrasing ascribable to the influence of the *Commedia* may be noted. One is the repetition of words at the beginning of successive lines, the two most striking cases of which are *Canz.* xii, 82 ff.:

Cesar che mia corona in testa tiene,
Cesar di buona spene,
Cesar del mondo franco domatore,

and *Canz.* xv, 107 ff.:

Con disprezzar la guerra e la discordia,
Con disprezzare i maledetti vizii,
Con disprezzare uffizii.

¹ *Inf.* xv, 1; xxiii, 32; xxiv, 62; xxviii, 80. *Par.* xxvi, 125.

² To the same cause are due such forms as *toscara*, *zampora*, etc.

Models for this sort of repetition are easily found in Dante.¹ The other is the use of phrases like *a solo a solo, a fronte a fronte*, of which Fazio has several: for the examples in the *Commedia*, see the Blanc-Carbone *Vocabolario Dantesco* (fifth ed., 1896), pp. 2-5. Since the devices were accessible to Fazio in Dante, it is reasonable to think that he took them from him.

We may now draw together the threads of our discussion, and set forth Fazio's relation to Dante as our scrutiny has revealed it. It is, as I have repeatedly insisted, the relation of a follower to a greater but kindred spirit, not that of a copyist to a model. We must consider our various parallels in the proportion they bear to Fazio's entire work; and we shall then realize how comparatively small a part of it they are. There are countless details in Dante which a mere imitator would have seized on, but which Fazio ignores — turns of phrase, historical allusions, figures of speech. To read him attentively is to be astonished at the extent to which he was able to resist the spell of his mighty predecessor, and to develop a type of lyric which is essentially his own, in conception and in phrasing; less intense, but full of picturesque imagery, and of a feeling that is delicate without ceasing to be natural and human.

To call Fazio and Dante kindred spirits is not, I think, an absurdity. Their cycles of development show a striking similarity; each begins with poems of love, passes on into fields of political and moral speculation, and ends with a long poem of a learned character. The difference, of course, lies here: Fazio has neither the intensity nor the intellectual grasp of Dante, and his orbit has a smaller radius; hence his later work gradually declines from his best level, and expires in erudition unexalted by poetry. We must attribute some part of this decline to his evil fortune; some, also, to his own less weighty mind, though few of his contemporaries could support the comparison with Dante with any better showing. Inevitably, Fazio's later work shows less distinction, less taste; and as theology of the scholastic type was ceasing to occupy men's minds — even had he been of a theological disposition — it was equally inevitable that his *Dittamondo* should assume an antiquarian cast, seldom illumined by such poetical power as he still retained. That the

¹ Cf. Oliver M. Johnston, "Repetition of Words and Phrases at the Beginning of Consecutive Tercets in Dante's *Divine Comedy*," in *Publ. Mod. Lang. Ass.*, Vol. XXIX (1914), pp. 537-549.

Dittamondo was written with any aim of rivalling the *Commedia*, as Pellizzari seems to imply, is to me highly improbable. It was the natural outgrowth of Fazio's temperament and the conditions of the age; unfortunately, Fazio had scarcely the ability requisite for a long poem, and was hampered by his unwieldy material. I suspect that he regarded the work rather as an occupation for his declining years than as a monument of his poetic skill.

This view of Fazio's character seems to me to be borne out by what we have noted as to his mode of adopting hints from Dante. In his earlier work he takes only what is consistent with his own poetic attitude, already fully established; later, as his inspiration begins to flag, he leans on the *Commedia* as a source of information; but in neither stage does he draw on Dante to replace his own intellectual activity. Even in the less-inspired work of his decline, he is still able to strike out an occasional arresting phrase; and when we review his relation to Dante as a whole, it must be with no small respect for one who, in proximity to one of the greatest poets of all time, contrived to maintain his own attitude and his own manner of expression.



20

THREE DANTE NOTES

BY ERNEST HATCH WILKINS

I. *INFERNO* I, 4 AND VIII, 122

In Guido delle Colonne's canzone beginning "Amor, ke lungamente m' à' menato" occur the lines:

ahi quanto è dura cosa al cor dolente
star quetamente e non far dimostranza!¹

Dante knew and liked this poem: he refers to it twice, with approbation, in the *De vulgari eloquentia*.² It is then highly probable that Guido's phrase "ahi quanto è dura cosa" was consciously or unconsciously in Dante's mind when he wrote the fourth line of the *Inferno*:

Ahi quanto a dir qual era è cosa dura.³

Scholars have long differed as to whether the first word of this line should be *ahi* or *e*.⁴ The probability that Dante's line is reminiscent of Guido's "ahi quanto è dura cosa" strengthens the opinion that Dante wrote "Ahi quanto" and not "E quanto."

¹ Lines 42-43. I quote from the edition by Monaci, in his *Crestomazia italiana dei primi secoli*, pp. 218-221. For this part of the poem (ll. 20-65) Monaci follows the Giuntina text, which was probably based upon the Palatine MS 418, which now lacks the leaf containing this stanza. Monaci gives also the variants of the Vatican MS 3793, the only MS which preserves this part of the poem. This MS in this case lacks its usual authority, for the poem, no. 305 in the order of the MS, was added by a hand later than that of the original scribe. The reading for line 42 is: "oiquante dura pena al core dolente."

² I, xii and II, v.

³ I quote from Professor Grandgent's edition.

⁴ The latest and most extensive discussion is that of Del Lungo and D'Ovidio, published as an appendix to Del Lungo's *Lectura Dantis* for the first canto of the *Inferno*, Florence, Sansoni (1913). The case can hardly be settled until the interrelations of the MSS are established. Del Lungo does not refer to all of the earlier discussions; some of those he does not mention contain good arguments in favor of the *ahi*.

The second stanza of the same canzone closes with the line:

saggio guerrieri vince guerra e prova.¹

This line, emphatic in its position, was very likely in Dante's mind, consciously or unconsciously, when he assigned to his *famoso saggio* the words (*Inf.* viii, 122):

Non sbigottir, ch' io vincerò la prova.

II. PURGATORIO XXVI, 71 ff.

Guido Guinizelli paid filial compliment to Guittone of Arezzo in a sonnet in "difficult" rhyme which opens with the octave:

Charo padre meo, de vostra laude
non bizogna c' alcun omo s' enbarchi;
ch' en vostra mente intrar visio non aude
che for de sé vostro saver non l' archi.
a ciascun reo sì la porta claude
che ssembra più 'n via che Venesia Marchi;
entr' a Ghaudenti ben vostr' alma ghaude
c' al me' parer li ghaldii àn sovr'alarchi.²

Guittone replied *per le rime* in a sonnet beginning:

Figlio mio dilettozo, in faccia laude
non con discrezion sembrami marchi.³

In this sonnet the rhymes are homonymous: *marchi* is used, in four different senses, for the four even lines of the octave.⁴

Dante paid filial compliment to Guinizelli in the 26th canto of the *Purgatorio*. The spirit of Guinizelli, as yet unidentified, speaks from the flame, briefly asking the unknown traveler if he be still mortal. Dante tells of the grace that permits his journey in the flesh, and asks in return "Chi siete voi?" The spirits marvel; then Guinizelli answers:

Ma poi che furon di stupore scarche
(Lo qual negli alti cor tosto s'attuta),
' Beato te, che delle nostre marche,
Ricominciò colei che pria m' inchiese,
' Per morir meglio esperienza imbarche . . . ' (ll. 71-75).

¹ Line 26. The Vatican MS reads "saggio guerrero uincie guerra epruoua."

² Monaci, p. 297.

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ Cf. Monaci's glossary, s. v. marchi.

At the end of his speech Guinizelli names himself. Then comes the clause containing Dante's characterization of Guinizelli:

Quand' i' odo nomar sè stesso il padre
Mio, e degli altri miei miglior, che mai
Rime d' amore usar dolci e leggiadre (ll. 97-99).

Dante so expresses his emotion that Guinizelli says to him :

' Dimmi che è cagion per che dimostri
Nel dire e nel guardare avermi caro ? ' (ll. 110-111).

Later, Guinizelli utters a severe criticism of Guittone. There are men, he says, whose literary likings are fixed without regard to art or reason; such gave an undue preference to Giraut de Bornelh; and other such paid undue honor to Guittone :

' Così fer molti antichi di Guittone,
Di grido in grido pur lui dando pregio,
Fin che l' ha vinto il ver con più persone ' (ll. 125-127).

The opening rhyme-words in Guinizelli's speech, *marche* and the rare *imbarche*, are virtually identical with the rhyme-words *enbarchi* and *Marchi* in Guinizelli's sonnet. This passage, like that sonnet, is an expression of filial compliment from a younger to an older poet; Guinizelli, complimenter in the sonnet, is complimented here. The agreement in rhyme-words under such circumstances makes it evident that Dante had the sonnet in mind when he wrote this passage; the borrowing of Guinizelli's own rhymes is indeed virtually a reference to the sonnet, and constitutes a compliment in itself. Probably Dante had in mind Guittone's sonnet as well.

This being the case, we may be confident that the opening words of Guinizelli's sonnet, "Charo padre meo," were in Dante's mind when he wrote :

il padre
Mio, e degli altri miei miglior,

and perhaps when he wrote :

Nel dire e nel guardare avermi caro.

It becomes evident, moreover, that the hostile reference to Guittone here is introduced as a correction of the opinion of Guittone expressed

by Guinizelli in the sonnet. Scorn of Guittone from a Guinizelli gifted with other-world insight is more effective than it could possibly be from other lips!¹ Perhaps Dante felt a certain satisfaction in confirming the deprecatory reproof contained in the first two lines of Guittone's sonnet to Guinizelli.

Dante's interesting treatment of Guinizelli in this case is similar to his procedure in the 20th canto of the *Inferno*, where an account of the founding of Mantua which Dante thought preferable to the account in the *Æneid* is, as Professor Grandgent says, "courteously put into the mouth of Virgil himself." ²

III. SUPPOSED PORTRAITS OF DANTE IN MICHELANGELO'S "LAST JUDGMENT"

In Michelangelo's fresco of the Last Judgment a man is represented as kneeling and leaning forward just behind St. Peter. The face, dark and faint, appears just to the left of St. Peter's right thigh; part of the body is visible between St. Peter's legs; and the left leg of the kneeling figure appears to the right of St. Peter's left leg. The face is in profile, the eye looking slightly upward toward the Christ.

Three English biographers of Michelangelo mention this figure, and report or express the opinion that the head is a portrait of Dante. Harford says:

In advance of the right-hand group is the Baptist, on the left St. Peter and St. Paul, and between their advancing limbs an animated head peeps out, which is said to be that of Dante.³

Black says:

Before quitting this part of the picture, it may be proper to refer to the suggestion that the kneeling figure behind St. Peter has been intended to represent Dante. The soiled condition of the fresco is too great to enable a

¹ For Dante's other references to Guittone, see *De vulgari eloquentia* I, xiii and II, vi, and *Purg.* xxiv, 56.

² Argument to *Inf.* xx. See also Professor Rand's discussion of the Manto problem in his *Dante and Servius*, in the Thirty-Third Annual Report of this Society, pp. 8-11.

³ J. S. Harford, *The Life of Michael Angelo Buonarroti*, London, 1858, Vol. II, p. 49.



A DETAIL OF MICHELANGELO'S "LAST JUDGMENT"

distinct examination of the features, of which all that can be said is that they have an intelligent, and, so to speak, portrait-like character, but there is no antecedent improbability in the suggestion. The poet had already been placed in a post of honour in Raphael's Parnassus; the enduring reverence in which he was held by Michael Angelo is well known, and the painter may have gladly indulged his hero-worship by placing the form of Italy's greatest poet in a far higher region than that already allotted to him. The humility of the attitude, and the earnest attempt to gain an imperfect glance at the Divine Brightness sufficiently vindicate the painter from any charge of over-boldness, and Michael Angelo might rejoice that he had within his power a means of testifying his devotion; for this monument at least he had no need to ask, and be refused permission by a worthless master.¹

Holroyd says:

Dante is there thirsting for deepest mysteries, his face positively thrust between St. Peter and St. Paul.²

The engraver Chapon, in his essay on the fresco, asserts that this figure represents St. Mark:

Près de saint Pierre, mais au second rang, saint Paul, l'apôtre et le docteur des nations. Saint Luc, son évangéliste, le suit, tandis que saint Marc se prosterne humblement aux pieds du prince des apôtres.³

Thode lists the many identifications proposed by Chapon, and expresses a general disapproval of his method and results.⁴ Thode himself regards the group in which the figure in question appears as a "Choir of the Apostles," and in his description refers to this figure as "eine jugendliche knieende Gestalt hinter Petrus." He does not, however, suggest a name for it.⁵

The head is not mentioned in any other study of Michelangelo accessible to me. It is not referred to by Professor Holbrook in his admirable volume on the portraits of Dante;⁶ nor, so far as I can ascertain, by any other writer on Dante iconography.

¹ C. C. Black, *Michael Angelo Buonarroti*, London, 1875, pp. 92-93.

² C. Holroyd, *Michael Angelo Buonarroti*, London, 1903, p. 220.

³ L.-L. Chapon, *le Jugement dernier de Michel-Ange*, Paris, 1892, p. 53.

⁴ H. Thode, *Michelangelo*, Vol. II, Berlin, 1908, pp. 49-50.

⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 55-56.

⁶ R. T. Holbrook, *Portraits of Dante from Giotto to Raffael*, London, 1911.

It seems to me possible, but hardly probable, that the head is a portrait of Dante.

Two Florentine frescoes offered precedent for the representation of Dante in such a scene as this: Giotto's "Paradise" in the Bargello — still visible in the lifetime of Michelangelo¹ — and Orcagna's "Last Judgment" in Santa Maria Novella. That Michelangelo was familiar with these two works there can be no reasonable doubt. Very probably he returned to them with special interest during his stay in Florence in the summer of 1534: he had already received the commission for the painting of his own "Last Judgment."² Within the Vatican itself, moreover, Raphael, in the "Disputa," had introduced Dante in holy company.

Michelangelo did indeed hold Dante in "enduring reverence." That reverence is attested not only in the two famous sonnets, but in Michelangelo's offer — to which the last words quoted from Black refer — to make a suitable monument for the poet, in case the Florentines should be allowed to bring back his exiled bones: "Io Michelagnolo scultore il medesimo a vostra Santità supplico, offerendomi al divin poeta fare la sepultura sua chondeciente."³ Moreover, the "Last Judgment" itself was influenced by the *Divine Comedy* — certainly in the figures of Charon and Minos, probably in the prominence of Adam and St. Peter and in the gesture and expression of St. Peter, very possibly in other respects.⁴

There is then abundant reason to expect a representation of Dante in the "Last Judgment."

The head of the figure kneeling behind St. Peter corresponds in its general character to the traditional Dante as represented by painters and sculptors from Orcagna to Raphael: there is the same leanness, the same proportion of the features, the same prominent nose, firm lips, and

¹ See Holbrook, p. 148.

² See E. Steinmann, *Die sixtinische Kapelle*, Munich, 1905, Vol. II, pp. 525-527; Thode, Vol. II, p. 3.

³ Steinmann, Vol. II, p. 561. The petition was signed in 1519.

⁴ See W. Kallab, "Die Deutung von Michelangelos Jüngstem Gerichte," in *Beiträge zur Kunstgeschichte Franz Wickhoff gewidmet*, Vienna, 1903, p. 138; Steinmann, Vol. II, pp. 569 ff.; K. Borinski, *Die Rätsel Michelangelos*, Munich, 1908, pp. 291 ff.; Thode, Vol. II, pp. 40-46; A. Farinelli, "Il Giudizio di Michelangelo e l'ispirazione dantesca," in *Scritti varii . . . in onore di Rodolfo Renier*, Turin, 1912, p. 511. Kallab, Steinmann, and Borinski certainly exaggerate the extent of Dante's influence; Thode and Farinelli, I think, err in the other direction.

strong chin. The fact that the head is in profile, too, brings it into accordance with the pictorial practice: the Dante portraits by Orcagna, Filippino Lippi,¹ Signorelli, and Raphael are in profile.

On the other hand, the face has a more youthful character — in the accompanying plate, at least — than one would look for in a post-Raphaelite portrait of Dante, and the treatment of the hair seems peculiar. But the plate is none too clear in either of these respects; other reproductions give a much more Dantesque impression. A study at close range of the painted head itself should settle the matter.

Chapon's assertion that the figure represents St. Mark has no other possible basis than the quite insufficient fact of the figure's proximity, in a humble position, to St. Peter. Thode's theory that the figure represents an apostle requires as premise that all the figures of the group represent apostles. But Thode himself remarks the presence of four women in the group, and it is further to be noted that the position and action of the figure in question differentiate it sharply from the more prominent forms about it.

Two other figures in the fresco have been thought to represent Dante.

Steinmann² held that Dante is represented in the figure emerging sleepily from the ground just at the left edge of the fresco. This theory, accepted by Spahn,³ is rejected by Borinski⁴ and Thode,⁵ and fairly ridiculed by Farinelli.⁶ Steinmann's statement that the figure wears the same Florentine costume and headgear that appear in recognized Dante portraits is quite wrong; the figure wears graveclothes, of the same sort as those worn by several of the neighboring figures.⁷

Borinski⁸ held that the scene within Hell-mouth represents Virgil's colloquy with Malacoda, as described in *Inferno* XXI, and that the

¹ See F. J. Mather, Jr., "Dante Portraits," in *The Romanic Review*, Vol. III (1912), pp. 117-118.

² Vol. II, pp. 583-584, 684.

³ M. Spahn, *Michelangelo und die sixtinische Kapelle*, Berlin, 1907, p. 195.

⁴ Pp. 296, 323.

⁵ Vol. II, pp. 42, 64.

⁶ P. 557.

⁷ This is sufficiently clear in Steinmann's own plate of the "Last Judgment," No. LXIV-LXV in the second of the two portfolios published with his work; it is clearer still in Della Casa's engraving of the lower left corner of the fresco, reproduced by Steinmann as plate LXIX in the same portfolio.

⁸ P. 323.

kneeling leg barely visible just at the lower left corner of the opening represents Dante in hiding! This theory, too, receives from Farinelli¹ the ridicule it deserves.

I take this opportunity to call attention to a drawing of Dante, in Christ Church Library, attributed by Berenson to the School of Antonio Pollaiuolo. The drawing has not been mentioned, I believe, in any study of the portraits of Dante. It is reproduced as plate XXII in the first volume of Berenson's *The Drawings of the Florentine Painters*.² It is described thus in his *catalogue raisonné*: "Full-length figure of Dante. Pen and bistre. H. 26 cm., w. 9 cm.";³ and thus in the text:

In Christ Church Library at Oxford there is a drawing for a Dante showing an open book. It is a charming but feeble copy of a lost Antonio, and the affinity with Castagno's Portraits of Worthies is distinctly felt.⁴

The drawing in the Print Room at Berlin representing the head of a man — probably Dante — with bay leaves in his cap, which is attributed by Krauss⁵ to Signorelli, is attributed by Berenson⁶ to Piero di Cosimo.

¹ Pp. 557-558.

² London, 1903.

³ Vol. II, p. 136.

⁴ Vol. I, p. 31. A footnote to the word "Antonio" reads: "The claw-like hands prove this conclusively, although of course the character of the drawing is, in other respects as well, unmistakable."

⁵ Ingo Krauss, *Das Portrait Dantes*, Berlin, 1901, pp. 51-52.

⁶ Vol. I, pp. 127-128; Vol. II, p. 130.

1019

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN



3 9015 03347 8614

OV 12

1971



